Television and Social Media Convergence (Convergence Continuum and Journalistic Convergence Analysis at Indosiar)

Moehammad Gafar Yoedtadi*, Andi Mirza Ronda and Umaimah Wahid

1 Tarumanagara University, Letjen S. Parman St. No. 1, Jakarta, 11440, Indonesia.
2 Sahid University Jakarta, Prof. DR. Soepomo St. No.84, Jakarta, 12870, Indonesia.
3 Budi Luhur University, Cileduk Raya St. Jakarta, 12260, Indonesia.

Authors’ contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

ABSTRACT

This study aims to determine the convergence process between social media and television in Indonesian television broadcasting companies, by taking a case study at a television broadcasting company called Indosiar. Convergence is carried out as a result of the large number of social media users in Indonesia. The number of internet users in Indonesia is 175.4 million people or 64% of the total population of Indonesia. Meanwhile, the number of social media users reaches 160 million people or 59% of Indonesia's total population. Many television broadcasting companies are converging with social media, one of them is Indosiar. The research using the observation method was carried out mid to late 2019. The research was stopped due to the Covid-19 pandemic. The research continued with in-depth interviews in early 2021. To find out the form of convergence that occurs in Indosiar, this study uses the concept of Pavlik (2001) regarding journalistic convergence: newsroom, newsgathering and content. Meanwhile, to determine the degree of convergence, this study uses the convergence continuum from Dailey, Demo and Spillman (2005). This research uses qualitative case study methods and data collection techniques through in-depth interviews.

Received 16 April 2021
Accepted 26 June 2021
Published 29 June 2021
with eight senior journalists and managers managing convergence, field observations and documentation. The results of the study conclude that the newsroom convergence that occurs in Indosiar is a type of Co-ordination of isolated platforms as formulated by Aviles et al (2009). The newsgathering convergence model at Indosiar is partial because it only occurs on special projects and does not become a daily work routine (Khadzig, 2016). The content convergence model that occurs in Indosiar is not yet capable of multiplatform (Tomic, 2015). Meanwhile, based on the convergence continuum, Indosiar has carried out the cross-promotion and cloning stages well, but has not fully carried out the coopetition and content sharing stages, and has not done full convergence at all.

Keywords: Convergence; social media; television; Indosiar.

1. INTRODUCTION

Competition between conventional media and online media in getting audiences is fierce in Indonesia. Conventional media including newspapers, magazines, radio and television compete with online media. In this competition, newspapers and magazines were most affected by the decline in circulation until the publication was closed.

In contrast to the condition of newspapers, magazines and radio, which continued to decline in advertising revenues, television advertising revenues were relatively stable. Nielsen Advertising Intelligence [1] data explains that television still dominates the portion of media advertising in Indonesia in 2020, which is 72% of the total advertising spending which reached Rp 229 trillion or 16 billion USD. The portion of television advertising decreased compared to the previous year which reached 85%, but in 2019 media advertising spending only reached Rp 168 trillion or 11.8 billion USD. Meanwhile, the portion of online media advertising in 2020 has reached 20% and the remaining 8% is shared by other media (newspapers, magazines, radio, etc.).

However, if we examine these data more closely, there has actually been a change in television audiences. As with newspapers, television also tends to be abandoned by young audiences. The results of research conducted by Nielsen Media Consumer [2] show that Indonesian citizens under the age group of 34 years, or the so-called millennial generation (20-34 years) and generation Z (10-19 years) rarely watch television. Both generations prefer to use the internet to find information and entertainment. Although the share of television advertising is still larger than other types of media, changes in audience audience must be considered. The loss of a young audience is a serious threat to the survival of the television business. Television cannot ignore young audiences, because data from Nielsen [2] shows that the number of audiences in the age group under 34 years old is increasing from time to time.

The facts above show a changing situation faced by the television broadcasting business in Indonesia. Now television does not only compete among televisions, but also has to grab the attention of internet users.

To overcome this competition, one of the innovations made by television is using social media to reach viewers. In some countries, the use of social media by television has given birth to a convergence concept between television and social media with the terminology of Social TV. Studies conducted by Borgomastro [3], Zelva [4], and Keinonen [5] show that the concept of Social TV is the use of social media that not only assists the production of television content, but is also used to enrich television program content. Social TV utilizes social media on the side of interactivity between users to get audience reactions or input on the course of the event. The presence of the concept of Social TV is quite reasonable. Cheng [6] research entitled Television Meets Facebook: The Correlation between TV Ratings and Social Media confirms the above data. Cheng study shows that television stations should invest in social media and engage audiences more actively. This research was conducted on Taiwanese television and used a model for calculating television ratings combined with the number of audience engagements on television's Facebook account. Cheng's study concluded that there is a relationship between social media activity (likes, shares, and comments) around TV shows and TV ratings. The greater the audience engagement on Facebook, the higher the ranking of the event.

Considering the facts above, a number of televisions in Indonesia have innovated using social media to increase the number of viewers.
The use of social media in television broadcasting can be considered as a convergence process, as many experts say that convergence is the merging of the functions of old media with new media in producing and distributing content [10].

This study aims to determine the use of social media in Indosiar using journalistic convergence from Pavlik [11], Grant and Wilkinson [12] which says that journalistic convergence occurs in three domains: newsroom (organizational structure), news gathering (journalistic practices) and news content (multimedia content). Newsroom convergence occurs when journalists from various types of media work in one newsroom with an integrated system or single newsroom. News gathering convergence occurs when journalists in the media are able to reach the level of multimedia or multiskill production. A journalist is required to be able to do work for media with various platforms, often referred to as a super journalist. Content convergence is when news can be presented in the form of multimedia, which is a combination of text, images, audio, video, blogs, podcasts, or slideshows.

This study also aims to find out how far the use of social media in Indosiar by using the convergence continuum from Dailey, Demo and Spillman [13]. Convergence continuum was created by Dailey, Demo and Spillman to explain the degree of convergence which has not been defined by experts, especially those related to communication theory regarding the diffusion process of convergence innovation in the newsroom. Convergence continuum is based on the assumption that there is interaction and cooperation between cross-media partners, whether they are jointly owned or not. Wahyuningsih and Zulhazmi [14] stated that this model is widely used, especially related to the news convergence process carried out in newsrooms. The continuum model suggests a step-by-step development of increasing levels in order to reach a higher degree of convergence (Aviles et al, 2009).

1.1 Problem Formulation

Based on the background of the problem, the formulation of the research problem is as follows: How is the convergence between social media and television at Indosiar based on journalistic convergence and the convergence continuum?

1.2 Objectives of this Study

a. What is the form of convergence between social media and television at Indosiar
process involving technological, economic, social, cultural, and policy dimensions. Hence the concept of “media convergence” refers to the process of integration of separate traditional modes of communication, affecting companies, technology, professionals and audiences in all phases of production, distribution and consumption of various forms of content. This process has far-reaching implications for corporate strategy, technological change, and the elaboration and distribution of content across platforms, the professional profile of journalists and the way audiences access content.

Convergence also occurs in the field of journalism. Inevitably, news editors must converge as technological demands, audience fragmentation and media company consolidation occur [12]. Audience fragmentation occurs due to differences in lifestyle. These differences affect how they obtain information and in what format the information is consumed.

The focus of journalistic convergence is currently concentrated on thinking about how to produce news, how to form the news, and how to distribute news. Pavlik (in Arviles and Carvajal) [20] divides journalistic convergence occurs in three models: newsroom (structure), news gathering (work process) and content (type of diversity). The same concept is also stated by Grant and Wilkinson (in Prihartono) [21] (in Iskandar) [22] that journalistic convergence is known in three models, namely newsroom convergence, newsgathering convergence, and content convergence. Newsroom convergence occurs when journalists from various types of media work in one newsroom with an integrated system. News gathering convergence occurs when journalists in the media are able to reach the multitasking level. A journalist is required to be able to do work for media with various platforms, dubbed a super journalist. Content convergence is when news can be presented in the form of multimedia, which is a combination of text, images, audio, video, blogs, podcasts, or slideshows.

Getting an overview of the news media convergence process is not easy. Dailey, Demo and Spillman [13] presented a convergence model called the Convergence Continuum. The model was created because they believe that there is a lack of a common behavior-based definition of convergence and a lack of commonality of instruments to measure the effect of convergence. Therefore, they suggest a
convergence continuum model with the aim of making it easier for researchers around the world to compare convergence results.

The convergence continuum has five stages in the process, namely:

1. Cross-promotion, means cooperation between two media to provide space for each other to introduce media content to each other.
2. Cloning, which is when content is reproduced to be loaded on other media without any changes.
3. Coopetition is the stage when converged media entities work together and compete at the same time.
4. Content Sharing which allows two different media to share content in the form of repackaging or even budgeting. Media convergence at this stage is mostly carried out by media under one ownership.
5. Full Convergence, which is when different media work together fully, both in terms of content collection, production, and distribution, and aims to maximize the unique characteristics of each medium to deliver content. In the full convergence stage, media that work together produce content and topics collaboratively by leveraging the strengths of their respective media platforms.

Research on the convergence process using journalistic convergence and the convergence continuum has been carried out to see the convergence process in various types of media. Aviles and Carvajal's research on newsroom convergence across media in Austria, Spain and Germany, uses the basis of journalistic convergence and the convergence continuum [20]. Landri, Suyanto and Yasir research uses a convergence continuum model to find out how the form of convergence is carried out in the Metro Riau daily newspaper [23]. Convergence was carried out between the Metro Riau newspaper and the online media HalloRiau.com. The research shows that the convergence process has been carried out at the stages of cross promotion, cloning, content sharing and coopetition, but the two media did not unify the newsroom (single newsroom) which caused the full convergence stage to have not been reached.

Kahdzig's research uses the convergence of newsroom, news gathering and content to see the form of convergence that has occurred in the Tribun Yogya [24]. The results showed that the 3M strategy (Multimedia, Multichannel and Multiplatform) carried out by the newspaper Tribun Yogya (print), Tribunnews.com (online) had succeeded in establishing convergence. However, the editor of the Tribun Yogya did not do a single newsroom convergence and only formed a multimedia desk level convergence.

The use of the convergence continuum and the journalistic convergence in this study has a reason. If the convergence continuum measures the degree of convergence by looking at the interaction and cooperation of journalists across media, journalistic convergence will look at the implications of this convergence on the structure of the newsroom, the news production process (newsgathering) and the diversity of content forms. As research conducted by Asyrir and Nurbaya [25]. This study uses a convergence continuum model to assess how far the success of convergence in the media MoeslimChoice.com, MoeslimChoice magazine and TV streaming MoeslimChoice on YouTube, and uses the concept of journalistic convergence to find out the form of convergence that has occurred, whether in the newsroom, news production (newsgathering) or content. By using the convergence continuum model, it can be seen that MoeslimChoice has converged up to five stages of the model. However, this study also shows that the convergence of MoeslimChoice is only limited to news content, and not yet in the form of newsroom and news gathering convergence.

3. RESEARCH METHODS

In order to get a picture of the convergence between television and social media in Indosiar, the researcher will use a qualitative approach. Cresswell [26] says that qualitative research is an approach to explore (exploratory) and understand the meaning of individuals or groups that are considered as social problems or human problems. The use of a qualitative approach is based on considerations because this study seeks to understand human behavior and experience and describe what it is about a symptom or phenomenon without testing hypotheses. This is different from the quantitative approach which aims to test hypotheses and is confirmatory [27]. This qualitative research is inductive (from specific to general) that is, it does not start from theory or test theory, but starts from symptoms or phenomena. In addition,
research on the convergence of social media and television at Indosiar intends to describe situations and events, not to test a hypothesis that there is a relationship between variables or the influence of variables that have already been made as quantitative research. Thus, this study uses a qualitative approach with the aim of exploring and understanding the convergence between social media and television in Indosiar. Convergence between social media and television can be categorized as a social problem, because it is related to the existence of mass media, especially television in serving the interests of the community in the field of information.

This research chooses the case study method with the aim of exploring a single entity or phenomenon (case) that is limited by time and activities in the form of programs, events, processes, institutions or social groups, and collects detailed information using various data collection procedures over a long period of time [28]. This research will examine the organization or institution, namely the Indosiar news organization in the convergence process between television and social media from 2016 to 2020. This study chose a case study because it examines a single case in the form of convergence activities between social media and television at Indosiar. The case study method was chosen as the most appropriate for analysing convergence, since it is acknowledged as a valid tool for analysing a complex issue and permitting research of a phenomenon in its own context [20]. Aviles and Carvajal [20] stated that case studies have frequently been used as a methodological tool to examine the implications of newsroom convergence (Dupagne and Garrison [29]; García Aviles and Carvajal [30]; Huang et al [31]).

A qualitative approach with the case study method is the choice in this study also based on previous research. Research by Landry, Suyanto, Yasir [23], Asyir and Nurbaya [25], Wahyuninggih and Zulhazmi [14] also chooses to use a qualitative approach to reveal media convergence.

In this study, research informants were determined using purposive sampling based on the standards determined by the researchers according to the research objectives [32]. The standards are determined based on the experience capacity and knowledge of research informants on matters related to the research focus in order to provide the required information. The informants of this research are stakeholders in Indosiar. Eight senior journalists holding the highest positions in editorial organizations, social media managers and support facility managers.

The technique of collecting data in this study was carried out by researchers in several ways, namely field observations, in-depth interviews, literature studies, and documentation of activities recorded during the research process. In-depth interviews conducted in this research process were conducted in an unstructured but in-depth manner but in an atmosphere of openness, friendliness and comfort. In accordance with the guidelines put forward by Bogdan and Taylor [33]. Data analysis and presentation techniques are carried out by taking steps to collect and prepare data, organizing the data that has been obtained, reducing and categorizing the data based on themes, concluding and presenting the data from the discussion as a characteristic of qualitative research, while still paying attention to the data validity criteria. The technical analysis and presentation of data carried out is as conveyed by Creswell [26] in qualitative data processing as follows: "Data analysis in qualitative research begins with preparing and organizing data (namely, text data such as transcripts, or image data such as photos) for analysis, then reduce the data to themes through the coding process and code summarization, and finally present the data in the form of charts, tables, or discussions.

In this study, to obtain valid data, triangulation is also necessary. Triangulation is a test of the validity of data obtained from various sources, various methods, and various times. Therefore, there are techniques for testing the validity of the data through source triangulation, method triangulation, and time triangulation. In this research, source triangulation and method triangulation were carried out. Source triangulation is done by checking the data obtained from several sources. Then the triangulation method is done by checking the data from the interviews with the data from the observations and the results of the analysis of the main documents or literature.

4. RESULTS OF STUDY AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Newsroom Convergence

Convergence between social media and television at Indosiar has been initiated since
2016. The convergence step was taken as part of anticipating the increasing use of the internet. Indosiar tries to take advantage of social media so that it continues to exist not only on television but also on the internet. For Indosiar, convergence with social media will expand the reach of their news content distribution and also in order to prepare new audiences among social media users. The Indosiar editor admits that the convergence of social media will not have much effect on television ratings, but by entering social media, Indosiar has prepared itself if one day the performance of television programs is not only calculated based on ratings but also calculated with the number of viewers, followers and engagement on social media. “We think that one day television viewership will decrease, so we have to start making changes in the way we work. In the past we only relied on television and then had direct contact with the audience, but we also had to improve our appearance on the internet. We also have to collect our followers, for example Indosiar has followers on YouTube” [34].

The choice to enter convergence with social media to face competition in the internet world is the right one. Considering the number of internet users in Indonesia is dominated by social media users. The data presented by Hotsuite 2021 shows that around 61.8 percent of the total population of Indonesia are social media users. Hotsuite 2021 also mentions that Indonesia is included in the top ten countries that are addicted to social media. Indonesia is in ninth place (Kumparan.Com, 2021) [35]. Thus social media becomes a powerful medium to attract the attention of internet audiences.

Indosiar's social media consists of Instagram (@Indosiar), Facebook (@IndosiarID.TV), YouTube (Indosiar), Twitter (@Indosiar). All Indosiar social media accounts are managed by PT Visual Indomedia Production (VIP). VIP is a subsidiary of PT Surya Citra Media Tbk (SCM) which is also the holding company of PT Indosiar Visual Mandiri (Indosiar). VIP, which has a business line producing digital content, web series and branded content, is in charge of managing the social media of SCM’s subsidiaries, including Indosiar. A separate social media management model and in the form of a separate company is the choice of SCM management for reasons of cost efficiency and human resources. If the companies under SCM each have a social media team, it will undoubtedly waste costs and human resources.

According to Aviles and Carvajal [20], newsroom convergence occurs when journalists from various types of media work in a single newsroom with an integrated system. If applied to television and social media, television editors and social media teams work in one newsroom with an integrated system. So far, the convergence of newsrooms between social media and television has not been carried out due to the unintegrated management of social media with Indosiar. This is different from the management of social media on television in the MNC Group where news editors on television under the MNC group, including RCTI, MNC, GTV and iNews, have their own social media accounts and are managed by a special social media team that is part of the television editorial team [8]. So that management and development can be done more freely.

Indeed, there is a desire for Indosiar to have its own social media account and be managed by an editorial organization. However, according to one research informant, this desire is difficult to realize considering that social media policy is held by a higher authority, the management of the SCM Group. With the many fields of media business owned by the SCM Group, it has resulted in the concentration of several types of businesses into similar business groups. For example, television broadcasting business groups, digital content business groups, online portal business groups, etc. “For us, we want to go towards each program that has its own. Ideally, each product has the right to have its own social media. The problem is that there will be few or many followers, right, but you must be given the opportunity first, if that's what I think. But it's true that the company's situation or policies of all kinds can't always be ideal," [36].

Indosiar's social media accounts are managed by a separate business entity from Indosiar, although they are still under the same parent company (SCM), namely VIP. This condition certainly brings its own advantages and disadvantages. The advantage is efficiency in terms of costs and the number of human resources. However, the disadvantage is that they cannot freely manage and develop their social media. Another problem is the poor coordination and cooperation between Indosiar's editors and VIP. Whereas newsroom convergence demands a neatly integrated work system. Bosio [37] stresses the importance of appointing managers and forming a social media team that is part of the editorial structure. They
have the same duties and responsibilities as producers in determining appropriate content and editorial and promotion strategies on social media. Social media managers have the task of facilitating the use of multiple social media accounts across various platforms and are integral to determining what platforms are used and for what purposes, how the content on each platform should be developed and used strategically, and how other workers in organizations should engage social media. As Bosio stated [37]: “Many researchers have noted the increasing appearance of social media editors and community managers in the newsroom of legacy, digital and online-only media organisations. These are often full-time staff members with duties and jurisdiction similar to an editor, but whose roles are completely dedicated to the use of social media tools for both editorial and promotional production of news.”

In addition, good newsroom convergence requires a single newsroom among media partners. This is revealed from the results of a study by Indrati, Santi, Irawan [38] which examined convergence in Media Groups (Metro TV, Media Indonesia and Medco.Id). Media Group's convergence strategy is to build a single newsroom that integrates the three media editors in one editorial organization and one editorial management. Media Group convergence does not only touch on organizational and managerial aspects, but also on technological aspects. Media Group builds a technology infrastructure that facilitates the production of news content for various media platforms. Single newsroom does not occur at Indosiar because social media is managed by a separate company.

The problem of coordination between the social media and television teams in the newsroom can actually be solved when the media organization appoints a social media manager and forms a social media team that is attached to the editor. Weaknesses that occur in the Indosiar editor are the absence of a special department or team assigned to produce converged content, and the absence of a special manager in charge of managing the development of social media convergence. The existence of an integrated social media manager and team in the editorial is absolutely necessary.

The form of newsroom convergence at Indosiar, which is separated into two different companies and the newsroom is not integrated, is actually one of the models of newsroom convergence in several European media. Aviles and Carvajal [20] in a study of newsroom convergence in several media in Austria, Spain and Germany found three convergence models in the newsroom: the first is called full integration, the second is cross media, and the third is called Coordination of isolated platforms. Newsroom convergence at Indosiar is Coordination of isolated platforms because according to Aviles and Carvajal: 1. Company convergence is only an option and newsroom convergence does not occur at all. 2. Cooperation is not implemented systematically in news gathering or news production or news distribution. 3. Newsroom design does not seek to be integrated. 4. Convergence occurs as a bottom-up process and depends more on the wishes of each journalist. 5. The editor-in-chief/media manager is not ready or interested in an organized cross-media strategy or convergence of news production, aggregation or distribution.

4.2 Newsgathering Convergence

According to Pavlik [11] news gathering convergence occurs when journalists in the media are able to reach the level of multitasking. One journalist is required to be able to do work for media with various platforms. In this case, Indosiar television journalists are required to have the ability to produce interesting content to be uploaded on Indosiar social media. Producing television news content is certainly different from content on social media. According to Ward [39] online content has characteristics, among others, tends to be short, considers keywords (Search Engine Optimization/SEO), and uses scanable text.

However, the failure of newsroom convergence at Indosiar brought consequences to imperfect news gathering convergence. Aviles and Carvajal [20] emphasize the importance of newsroom convergence as part of newsroom management. This has a direct influence on the practice of media journalism (newsgathering) and the quality of its products (content). As Aviles and Carvajal stated: “Newsroom management has a direct bearing on the medium’s journalism practices and the quality of its output.”

As a result the synergy and cooperation of the VIP social media team and the Indosiar editorial team in producing content cannot be done routinely every day. Cooperation and synergies in the convergence process only occur in projects covering special events. Namely, Jokowi Mantu (wedding of President Jokowi’s daughter),
the President’s Cup Football Competition, the Commemoration of the Proclamation of August 17, Simultaneous Regional Head Elections and the Mudik Asyik (homecoming activities during the Eid al-Fitr coverage). In these special projects, Indosiar and the VIP social media team can work together in a more planned and organized manner. The synergy between the two media is going well. Even Indosiar as a news content producer is given the freedom to manage Indosiar Instagram during the special program. The project is named Instagram Take Over. In this project, Indosiar temporarily takes over the management of Indosiar’s Instagram to be filled with editorial production content during the event. “We have held Instagram take over, IG stories takeover. So Indosiar’s IG that day was in control, being the admin was all the news team when there was an event. Each person has the right to access it themselves and make their own videos, upload them on Indosiar’s Instagram,” [40].

The newsgathering convergence at Indosiar has not yet become a work routine, but only occurs on special projects. Synergy and cooperation between Indosiar journalist and the VIP social media team is only carried out on special events. This shows that the newsgathering convergence model is not complete and is still partial. In his study, Khadzig [24] calls this model a partial convergence or convergence by project. Partial convergence is a convergence that is incomplete or not yet a complete unity. In other words, the pattern of cooperation and synergy that occurs is not yet a routine.

4.3 Content Convergence

Integrated technology infrastructure is important in content convergence. Because it makes it easier for each media to use content produced by media that is converging. This was also revealed from the research of Wahyuningsih and Zulhazmi [14] who conducted research on the convergence that occurred in the daily newspaper Radar Jogja with their websites and social media. Radar Jogya implements a single newsroom for the print editor and digital team, making it easier to retrieve news for each platform. The existence of a single newsroom makes it easier for online editors to edit manuscripts before they are published on websites and social media.

Meanwhile, Indosiar does not yet have an integrated technology infrastructure between social media and television. Television news content cannot be retrieved directly by the VIP social media team because they do not have access to television newsroom servers (AVID iNews Server and Quantel Digital Production). To get television content, the VIP social media team must capture Indosiar news programs. Of course this takes time. The recording is then processed again for upload to social media. The same thing happens when social media content is about to be broadcast live on television because AVID iNews Server and Quantel Digital Video Production are closed systems. As a result, Indosiar journalists have not been able to automatically produce one content for various types of platforms.

Repeating technology is certainly a new problem because the costs are not cheap. It was acknowledged by research informants that television investment is very expensive in building studios and all news production systems, to replace them with new ones requires large costs.

“Television investment is when building studios and news production systems, it is very expensive equipment. The license is also very expensive, we buy it expensively. And to change it to be very flexible, which doesn't close, it's not that easy because this tool is designed to only close. In some Asian countries, which have started to dismantle old TVs with full internet and can be used by mobile phones, you can easily create TV content that can be turned into short content on social media and on websites. But that costs a lot” [34]. Technology infrastructure that is not integrated between television and social media causes content convergence not run easily. In fact, as Tomic [41] said, content convergence is when one news item can be easily published automatically into various types of platforms. As Tomic stated: “Content integration through popular internet services and social media allows one article (post) which is published on a portal, website, or blog, to automatically appear on other internet points such as relational websites, portals, blogs, or one of the social networks. Integration is possible in all aspects and directions between which a one-way or two-way interaction of published content is designed and programmed.”

Various research findings on journalistic convergence at Indosiar can be explained in the following model. Newsroom convergence that occurs in Indosiar is a type of Co-ordination of isolated platforms as formulated by Aviles and
Carvajal (2009). The newsgathering convergence model at the Indosiar editorial team is partial because it only occurs on special projects and does not become a daily work routine (Khadzig, 2016). The content convergence model that occurs in Indosiar is not yet capable of being multiplatform automatic (Tomic, 2015).

4.4 Degree of Convergence Based on Convergence Continuum

4.4.1 Cross-promotion

Cross-promotion, is an early stage of continuum convergence. The form of cross-promotion is seen from the use of words or image elements to promote or introduce media content produced to be published on other platforms. This is usually done by publishing visually or by displaying the logo on a regular basis. In addition, this form of cross promotion can be done by introducing content between platforms verbally, and holding meetings to discuss the content to be promoted on each platform [13]. The cross-promotion stage between social media and television has gone well because the editors of Indosiar from the beginning have determined that one of the goals of convergence between social media and television is promotion. The goal is how to reach social media users to be interested in watching Indosiar news programs. Social media is believed to be able to help television attract new audiences and become a promotional medium for television content. “So far, we are afraid of the information presented on social media before mainstream media. But it turns out that we can cultivate it, in fact it will be able to attract people, not television viewers, but social media users to watch television instead.” [42].

One form of promotion is using Twitter to promote news produced by Indosiar. Twitter has an advantage in disseminating information because it uses text with a limit of 280 characters. With this short message, Twitter has speed in delivering information [43]. Greer and Ferguson [44] concluded that television stations will get two advantages when using Twitter, supplying news as well as promoting their news programs to the public. Apart from Twitter, Indosiar is also actively using Facebook and Instagram for promotions. The choice of Facebook and Instagram as promotional media is appropriate because they have advantages from the audio-visual aspect. According to the study of Greer and Ferguson [45] who said that the choice of Instagram as a promotional media by television was based on its character that accentuated the visual aspects of its content (visual nature).

Van Es study [46] concluded that the use of social media as a means of promoting television programs is very effective in increasing brand awareness. A program can expand its brand recognition by using social media, and encourage social media users to become marketers by re-tweeting, sharing and liking the program’s brand. As Van Es stated “Social media use helps television shows increase brand awareness. I call this brandoriented activity the “promotional” application of social media. A show can easily spread its brand name among its viewers’ social networks by encouraging them to (re) tweet, share, or like content. In this manner, audiences are turned into marketers, in that social media are “vehicles for promoting viewership by encouraging potential viewers to tune in to what their friends are watching”.

Fig. 1. Convergence Model at Indosiar
Television cross-promotion for social media is carried out verbally, which is spoken by the presenter when inviting the audience to follow the development of events through Indosiar social media. In accordance with the formulation of cross promotion by Dailey, Demo and Spillman [13] that the form of cross promotion can be done with speech (words).

### 4.4.2 Cloning

The cloning stage occurs regularly at Indosiar where news program content is always uploaded to Indosiar’s social media, especially YouTube and Facebook. The form of news uploads is in Video-on-demand (VOD) format. The Indosiar news program was not uploaded in its entirety, but underwent an editing process (chop), which is cutting it into short clips. This fits the character of YouTube and Facebook videos that don’t require long durations. “If we upload it to YouTube or Facebook or on Instagram, we usually cut it into pieces from the news that is broadcast. So we cut the news that airs for us to process again on social media.

Now, there are those of us who upload the news, then they are given a caption, and they are given another caption so that the content is interesting enough to become a conversation” [47].

Uploading news videos to social media, especially YouTube, is expected to increase the audience of Indosiar’s YouTube channel. Uploading to YouTube will help television viewers who missed watching the news. This is in accordance with the results of a study by Setiawan and Purwasito [46] that many television stations upload videos of their main programs (reshows) to YouTube with the aim of increasing the number of viewers of the program. For viewers who are late to watch on television, they can watch it through the television station’s channel on YouTube. Thus the number of viewers will continue to grow. A study by Setiawan and Purwasito [48] concluded that TV viewing patterns have also changed since social media came into existence. Viewers are not completely fixated on showtimes and broadcast times. In the era of YouTube social media, people can watch TV anytime and anywhere. Watching television shows is also not always done from a television set, but many viewers, especially the younger generation, watch via smartphones or laptops.

### 4.4.3 Coopetition

Coopetition is the stage when converged media partners cooperate and compete with each other at the same time or when collaborating. The coopetition stage is marked by activities that reflect that members of each platform are still competing with other platforms. At this stage, both staff members must exercise the nature of cooperation and competition simultaneously. This means that even though the two platforms are in one medium, each member must be able to apply a cooperative and competitive attitude [13]. At the coopetition stage, Indosiar’s editors did not perform this stage perfectly. This is because the two media partners, television and social media, do not compete but only cooperate. The VIP social media team does not produce content, but only admins. The production of social media content is mostly done by the television news team. So that there is no competition in content production. “So the point of cooperation is more towards them giving their account passwords. Instagram takeover is basically we hold the password that day, during the event.” [40].

The situation is certainly different from the convergence that occurred on MNC group television. Yoedtadi and Hapsari’s research [8] shows that the social media team on MNC group televisions does not only work as an admin for uploading content (uploader), but also acts as a content creator. On some special events, MNC's social media team and television coverage team collaborated and competed in producing content. For example, in the 2018 Simultaneous Regional Head Elections (Pilkada Serentak), both the television team and the MNC social media team produced content and collaborated as well. This is possible because the MNC social media team, which is part of the television editorial staff, has a separate production team. However, the coopetition stage at Indosiar is in accordance with the convergence of the Tribun Yogya and the Tribun Online [24]. The coopetition stage at the Tribun Yogya only occurred in a pattern of mutual cooperation and no pattern of competing with each other. The reason is that the Tribun Yogya and the Tribun Online have the principle of mutual benefit for both parties. Because they were created by the same institution and with the same goal, namely to grow the business of Tribun Jogja. According to Dailey, Demo and Spillman [13] the degree of convergence that occurs in one stage may not be perfect. Each stage in the convergence of the continuum may
not be perfect, partners may perform well on one side (cooperation) but not perform on the other (competition). “Five circles on the continuum illustrate that each stage is characterized by a range of behaviors that can overlap as the degree of interaction and cooperation activities increases. The arrows on the continuum show that a partner’s place on the model is not fixed; it can move back and forth depending on the nature of the news and the commitment to convergence by workers and managers. For example, partners might demonstrate a greater degree of interaction and cooperation on a special project, such as election coverage, but exhibit lesser degrees of interaction and cooperation during the average news day.” Dailey, Demo and Spillman [13].

4.4.4 Content sharing

Indosiar editors carry out the content sharing stage unilaterally, sharing content only from television to social media. It can't be the other way around from social media to television. This is due to the different content models between television and social media. Television news content has more weight, is presented seriously, is unidirectional. While social media content is more relaxed, more often in the style of a video blog (vlog) and engages in interactivity with the audience. As one informant explained that creating content on social media is more relaxed than on television, presenters don't need to dress up neatly and don't need a good backdrop. “If you are a TV presenter, you have to be serious, the background must be good, the clothes are good, not on the internet. It's enough for you to talk briefly and I don't need you to dress very neatly, you just relax.” [34].

The differences in television news content models and social media can be explained from the cultural differences between journalism and social media. Journalism puts forward objectivity, neutrality and impartiality in its news [18]. In producing news, a journalist must distance himself from the facts to be reported, in other words, he must not include his personal opinion because obtaining the ultimate truth is the main goal [49]. On the other hand, on social media content, personality and subjectivity are highlighted because they are the main attraction. Intimacy and closeness are important features in social media. Intimacy and closeness in social media are based on social presence theory [50]. As Kaplan and Hainlein explained: “The two key elements of Social Media. Regarding the media-related component of Social Media, social presence theory (states that media differ in the degree of "social presence"—defined as the acoustic, visual, and physical contact that can be achieved—they allow to emerge between two communication partners. Social presence is influenced by the intimacy, and immediacy of the medium. The higher the social presence, the larger the social influence that the communication partners have on each other’s behavior.”

In addition to the different content models between television news and social media, the content sharing stage at the Indosiar editorial team is also constrained by the incompatible technology infrastructure to provide content sharing facilities. Indosiar's news production technology infrastructure is a closed system, which makes it difficult for social media content to be broadcast on television quickly and automatically. Technology infrastructure is a challenge for Indosiar if it wants to optimize the convergence of the content sharing stage between social media and television. At least Indosiar must change its technology infrastructure that has multimedia production automation features. Veglis et al. [51] reveal the problem that is often faced by media companies that apply the cross-media convergence model is automation technology in the production of multimedia content.

4.4.5 Full convergence

At this stage, Indosiar has not been able to achieve full convergence. Various obstacles are still blocking the convergence process between social media and television to reach the stage of full convergence. One of the reasons is that Indosiar has not yet formed a special team and appointed the person in charge of social media at the editorial office. As Dailey, Demo and Spillman [13] say that at full convergence, it can only be done when there is a joint team of journalists from partner organizations working together to plan, report and produce a story, while deciding which part of the story is most effective in the form of print, broadcast and digital. According to Indosiar editorial informants, they do not want to fully converge with social media. The reason given by the informants is that the performance of television news programs is still based on the calculation of Nielsen’s rating and has not been measured by achievements on social media. This situation may indicate a dilemmatic position faced by
Indosiar editors. In the midst of efforts to converge with social media, the reality is that the Indonesian television ecosystem has not moved from the traditional business model of selling ratings to advertisers. The relationship between rating and the number of engagements on social media has not yet become a measure on Indonesian television. In contrast to the condition of newspapers, magazines and radio whose advertising revenues continue to decline, the advertising revenues of television broadcasting companies are relatively stable. Nielsen Advertising Intelligence data shows that television still dominates the portion of Indonesian media advertising in 2020, which is 72% of the total advertising expenditure of Rp 229 trillion or around 16 billion US dollars. The portion of television advertising decreased compared to the previous year which reached 85%, but media advertising spending in 2019 only reached Rp 168 trillion or around 11.6 billion US dollars. Meanwhile, the portion of online media advertising in 2020 will reach 20% and the remaining 8% will be contested by other media (newspapers, magazines, radio, etc.). In 2020, Indosiar was able to earn around 140 million USD. Seeing the large portion of television advertising, it is certainly not wrong if Indosiar still sticks with the conventional business model.

The market reality faced by Indosiar can be explained from the results of research by Aviles et al. who explained in their study that one of the important factors influencing how convergence progresses among media partners is the market situation. One of the questions in Aviles research was "Do the market situation and decisions on new business models influence the editorial convergence process?". Conclusion Aviles et al. were media partners who are converging will react to changing market situations by changing new business models. This seems to have happened at Indosiar when they saw that the market situation and television business model had not changed much, namely selling only ratings to get advertisements, causing no desire for full convergence. In fact, according to the researcher's view, Indosiar is not worried if the convergence process with social media is running in place.

Although separate and more focused research is needed to determine the impact of convergence between social media and television, Indosiar's audience share data from 2016 (when the convergence process begins) until 2020 can provide an overview of the impact of this convergence. In 2016, Indosiar's audience share stood at 12.5. In 2017, Indosiar's audience share rose to 13.2. In 2018, Indosiar's audience share reached 13.9. In 2019, Indosiar's audience share rose to 14.7. In 2020 Indosiar's audience share rose to 15.8.

Based on the results of research analysis regarding the degree of convergence based on the convergence continuum in the Indosiar editor, it can be described in a model. Borrowing the convergence continuum model from Daily, Demo and Spiellman, but with modifications to suit the conditions that occur in Indosiar. Indosiar has carried out the stages of cross-promotion and cloning so that it is described as a full circle and blue in color. Meanwhile, Indosiar has not yet fully carried out the coopetition and content sharing stages, so the circular model is depicted as a dotted line and plain in color. Furthermore, Indosiar does not perform full convergence, which is indicated by a circle of small dots.

**Fig. 2. Degree of convergence based on convergence continuum**
5. CONCLUSION

Based on the research analysis, it can be concluded that Indosiar has realized a change in the pattern of media use in society. Namely the habit of seeking entertainment and information through television media, moving to the internet. Although admitted by the informant that the change is not too worrying for television managers. Internet users in Indonesia continue to grow, but the number of television viewers is still large. However, Indosiar editors need to prepare new work patterns and new viewers on the internet.

To anticipate this, Indosiar's editors conduct television convergence with social media. Social media is an option because the use of the internet in Indonesia is dominated by social media. Social media is believed to be able to help television editors expand content distribution as well as become a promotional tool to popularize Indosiar news among social media users. However, in this convergence with social media, the Indosiar editors found problems:

a. Does not have its own social media account.

b. Not managing their social media, but managed by another company (VIP).

As a result of these conditions, the consequences faced by Indosiar editors in convergence with social media are as follows:

1. Unable to perform newsroom convergence. This is because it does not have a single newsroom and does not form a special manager and social media team that is integrated in the editorial.

2. Can do newsgathering convergence. Although only done on special projects and cannot be done as a daily work routine.

3. Unable to perform content convergence. This is due to an unintegrated work system and technological infrastructure that does not yet allow multi-platform production automation.

Furthermore, in measuring the degree of convergence of social media in Indosiar editors based on the convergence continuum, the following conclusions are drawn:

1. The cross-promotion stage has been carried out regularly because the goal of social media convergence at Indosiar from the start was as a promotional medium. Either television promotion on social media, or vice versa social media promotion on television.

2. The cloning stage has been carried out routinely by uploading television news content to social media (Facebook and YouTube) with a little repackaging.

3. The coopetition stage has not yet occurred perfectly, namely only cooperating but not competing. This is because the social media team managed by VIP does not produce their own content, but only becomes an admin.

4. The content sharing stage has been carried out even though it only occurs on special projects. Meanwhile, as a work routine, content sharing cannot be carried out due to the constraints of the unintegrated work system and the incompatible technology infrastructure between social media and television.

5. The full convergence stage cannot be carried out for several reasons:

   a. Indosiar's social media convergence policy is not targeted at achieving full convergence. Social media convergence is only to change work patterns and news promotion.

   b. Indosiar prioritize achieving high ratings on television rather than achieving achievements on social media. Because the television business model is still focused on selling ratings to advertisers and has not taken into account achievements on social media.

CONSENT

All authors declare that written informed consent was obtained from the patient (or other approved parties) for publication of this case report and accompanying images. A copy of the written consent is available for review by the Editorial office/Chief Editor/Editorial Board members of this journal.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

2. Taufik H. Viewers and advertisers on TV are starting to switch. Lokadata.id. 2020;4:4.
Accessed 12 April 2021


Available:https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1527476415616192

Available:https://doi.org/10.1515/nor-2016-0037

Available:http://dx.doi.org/10.4236/ajibm.2016.63026

7. Suwandri S, Hafizni. Convergence trends in the television media industry-A case study on the implementation of media convergence in metro tv, Jakarta. The international conference on design and technology, KnE Social Sciences. 2017;83–89.

Available:https://doi.org/10.30656/lontar.v8i1.1540


Available:https://doi.org/10.1080/14241270.2003.9939023

Available:http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1354858004004002


Available:https://doi.org/10.1207/s13548580ajc1303_22

Available:http://dx.doi.org/10.22515/ajdc.v1i1.2412


Available:https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1354856516678410


34. Interview with research informant 1; 2021.


36. Interview with research informant 2; 2021.


40. Interview with research informant 3; 2021.


42. Interview with research informant 4; 2021.


47. Interview with research informant 4; 2021.


© 2021 Yoedtadi et al.; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history:
The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
http://www.sdiarticle4.com/review-history/70391